

# **AROGYAM kick-off workshop**

## **Minutes of final meeting: 4<sup>th</sup> June, 2013: 9:30-12:30**

Minutes by: Roger Jeffery, Sundari Ravindran, Debbie Menezes & Supurna Banerjee

Opening session led by Roger:

1. There has to be a detailed plan of action from each sub-theme group.
2. Applications/proposals should have a rough estimate of costs which included institutional cost. Finer details can be worked later. The hosting body should be funding the local expenses.
3. Bo: there should be a steering committee for the network. If there is a shortage of funds, the steering committee will then have to rank the proposals in terms of feasibility etc.

### **Action 1: Roger to establish the Edinburgh steering committee.**

4. Mohan: before the ICCR released their funds there was a change in the budget and there has to be a discussion on the changes in the budget and what implications that has.
5. Timeline: Since Bo will be away in late July, the group coordinators will have to send their proposals to the local coordinator by no later than 9 am on 29<sup>th</sup> July. They will receive a decision from the four coordinators around 10<sup>th</sup> August (or slightly later).

### **Action 2: Group co-ordinators to send proposals by 29 July**

### **Action 3: Local leaders to agree decisions about funding by 10 August**

6. Though more sub-themes have emerged from the four main themes in the original proposal, they still remain very much within those four themes, and there is no need to rebadge what we are doing.
7. Does the entire network need to meet half way or are the projects sufficient to carry the network through? Possibility of other conferences – in Edinburgh and elsewhere – where the participants can come without having to spend AROGYAM money and use of video-conferences/Skype calls should always be kept in mind.

## ***Reports from sub-theme groups:***

### **1. *Global Governance:***

*Members:* Sylvia Sax, Jeff Collins, Raman Kutty, Mohan Rao ,Anuj Kapalashrami, Harish Naraindas, Rama Baru , Devi Sridhar (?).

*Concepts:*

1. New actors and discourses in GG and gaps in research on them.
2. Impact of Global Health initiatives in local case context. E.g. technology and farmers.
3. India as a global actor and how it is influencing the European context.
4. NCDs /commercial sector could be a subset of GG.

*Aims:*

1. Publication.
2. Conference.
3. Sharing teaching resources

*Actions:*

1. Developing a concept note for workshop in Delhi in 2014 followed by a 2<sup>nd</sup> one in Edinburgh as a part of ASA. **Sylvia, Rama and Anuj.**

## **2. NCDs.**

Members: Michael Marx, Sylvia Sax, Jeff Collins, Ritu Priya (?)

*Concepts:*

1. Governance, palliative care, self management, cultural perspectives, role of traditions, social determinants, reducing inequalities, lifestyle diseases vs biomedical.
2. Industrial production of NCDs—trans-national food-drink industry, commercialisation of health, advertising, policy coherence, economic impact of NCDs, consumption pattern.
3. Leaving room for creative proposals.
4. This theme speaks directly to commercialization. (Anuj).

*Aims:*

1. Colloquium.
2. Teaching activities.
3. Concept note and inventory of existing research.
4. Proposal for case study.

*Action:*

?

## **3. Globalizing mental health**

Members: Bo Sax, Johannes Quack, Hasan Ashraf, Harish Naraindas, Ananda Samir Chopra, Karin Polit, Jacob Copeman, Stefan Ecks, Sumeet Jain, Raman Kutty, Biju Soman, Eva Ambos, Ritu Priya, Debbie Menezes

*Concept:*

1. Initiatives in India which are being discussed controversially. What kind of interventions need to be made? These movements of services, provisions of services. It is important to avoid viewing India as passive but as an active agent.
2. Political economy of mental health: psycho pharmaceuticals, ethnography of pharmaceuticals used, other kinds of expert social psycho help.
3. Culture and value: ritual and faith based cure in Europe and India. Disciplining mental health in Foucauldian way.
4. Palliative care.

*Aims:*

1. Conference.
2. Exchange.

*Action:*

1. A proposal/ concept note to be circulated to the members of the group (**Bo**) and the members will then send abstracts on it. Proposed panel for the ASA conference in Edinburgh next year or a conference in Europe. (June-July 2014)
2. The two days conference to be immediately followed by a two days of developing a proposal.

*Other points:*

1. If the conference is organized in Heidelberg students who are in these disciplines but not a part of the network can also take part. They cannot be funded by the network but if they can provide their own funding they can participate.
2. Liz Grant is trying to organize a summer school in India next year. Seeing if the workshop/exchange etc. can collate with that.

#### **4. Pharmaceutical markets**

Members: Hasan Ashraf, Roger Jeffery, Ian Harper, Sundari Ravindran, Mohan Rao.

*Concept:*

1. Studying the drift of pharmaceuticals from regulated to unregulated markets. The study to be conducted through psychotropic medicines and emergency abortion pills.
2. Study of different medicines. Looking at the historical background of medicine and the spread of its network.
3. Pharmaceutical and media interface especially women and children.

*Aim:*

1. Proposal (long term plan) for studying the drift from regulated to unregulated pharmaceutical markets.

*Action:*

1. Developing the proposal. **Hasan** and **Roger**.

*Other things:*

Possible link with GG as there are cross-cutting themes.

## 5. HIV AIDS

*Members:* George Palattiyil, Dina Sidhva, Anuj Kapalashrami, Liz Grant, K. N. Srinivasan, Sundari Ravindran.

*Concept:*

*Aim:*

1. Research proposal.
2. Teaching course.
3. Workshop with edited volume.
4. Synergy with HHRD.

*Action:*

1. Develop proposal. **George**
2. Teaching: **K. N. Srinivasan, Sundari Ravindran, George Palattiyil, Dina Sidhva, Anuj Kapalashrami, Liz Grant.**
3. Synergy with HHRD: ?

*Other issues:*

1. Possible links with GG and its policy strands. Biography of NGOs.

## 6. Tuberculosis

*Members:* Rajib Dasgupta, Ian Harper, Sundari Ravindran, Ramila Bisht.

Potential contributors to the edited volume: Mohan and Rama's PhD student.

*Concept:*

1. Looking at the historical aspects: Failure of the former programme (involves a bit of a primary work)
2. International financing.
3. Programme Governance.

*Aims:*

1. Edited volume on 25 years of dots. **Ian and Rajib** editors
2. Workshops – research workshop in Delhi early 2014 (synergizing this with other groups). And a larger workshop with chapter authors in late 2014-early 2015.

*Action:*

1. Drafting the concept note for the edited volume. **Rajib and Ian**

*Other:*

A. Funding:

1. Some aspects like the final workshop will be linked with AROGYAM.
2. Wellcome Trust money can be used for primary data collection.
3. Also if people from outside the network are to be invited some money could come from the Wellcome Trust.

B: Karina: There are two PhD students in the communicable disease programme in Leeds who could be brought in if there is an additional source of funding. Also international experts can be brought in.

## 7. Infectious diseases and TB

*Members:* Ian Harper, Karina Kleinman, Sanndra Bärnreuther, Alice Street (?)

*Concept:*

1. Diagnostics and technologies. This weaves its way through various levels of patient experience. Other technologies like mobile phones etc. this links in through multiple levels such as GG but also through other diseases on malaria.
2. Possibility of being a sub-theme of bio-technology?

*Aim:*

1. Paper on diagnostics in infectious diseases.

*Action:*

1. Conceptual paper: **Ian** and **Karina**.

## **8. Medical Tourism**

*Members:* Margret Frenz, K. N Srinivasan, Roger Jeffery, Rama Baru, Sandra Bärnreuther

*Concept:*

1. Medical tourism as working title. A concept note on how to reconceptualise this.
2. Quality assurance in public and private hospitals. Links to commercialization.
3. NIRS
4. Marketing medical tourism from allopathic and Ayurvedic medicine.
5. What are the motivations for European companies to choose Indian markets? What is the governance?
6. Specific study. A workshop to develop on the Indo-European fertility private market networks. Looking at commercialization and transformation in German markets. (Ramila)
7. Mapping of European and Indian clinic through formal and informal networks.

*Aims:*

1. Scoping studies. Getting money for 3 places (comparative view: India, Scotland and Germany) to show the multiple movement.
2. Workshop or colloquium or a proposal developing meeting
3. Teaching module possible for Summer School (Liz's summer school) or with the money from Heidelberg
4. At the back of the workshop to come up with proposals to be put into the funding bodies.

*Action:*

1. **Margret** and **Srinivasan** (?) to develop proposal for the study.

*Other issues:*

1. Reconnecting with Juel Henefeld (check name). Two people on Germany who work in this field in Africa.
2. Dental tourism (Thankappan)?
3. Hip replacement (Karina)?

## 9. Surrogacy

*Members:* Sunita Reddy, Dina Sidhva, George Palattiyil

*Concept:*

1. Parent's perspective on surrogacy.
2. Can be included as a section of medical tourism? (Mohan)

*Aims:*

1. Conception workshop or seminar in August 2014.
2. Using the scoping study started by George and Dina on surrogacy for research proposal.

*Action:*

1. Research proposal on commissioning parent's perspectives on surrogacy:  
**Sunita, Dina and George.**

*Other issues:*

1. A recent thesis on relevant topic completed by Sheila from U of Heidelberg.

## 10. Commercial sector and public health:

*Concept:*

1. Newer institutional and legislative frameworks have been emerging to enable the commercial sector.- GHIs and philanthropies.
2. Tensions between trade and PH objectives:
  - a. Health policy- impact of healthcare- tobacco, food and beverage, managing COI
  - b. Health system issues – World Bank preference for private actors.
  - c. Health research
3. Exploring methodological challenges –Sources? methods of data collection for sensitive data and non-transparent commercial sector?
4. Ongoing dialogue on comparative examples of commercialisation
5. Some sessions as a part of GG ? NCD? Gender and sexual health?

*Aims:*

1. Teaching resource sharing including key articles.
2. Workshop in February 2014 in Delhi.
3. Methodology training/workshop

*Action:*

1. Teaching resources repository – possible zotero library or drop box, website for AROGYAM – **Jeff Collins, Mohan Rao.**
2. Workshop organization (combined with GG) – **Anuj, Rama, Sylvia.**
3. Methodology proposal – **Ramila.**

*Other issues:*

1. Tacit assumption that the topic is about non-commercial. The historical dimension is important – when did it stop being commercialized. Political aspects may be involved here – how is this service different from other services. (Anand).
2. Actors are working for private interests, and this language pervades the systems or ignore to see that. (Bo).
3. Conflict of interest between the different aspects in different contexts, different policies. (Sarah)
4. Is there a connection between Scotland and Indian systems? Is it an alternative? (Thankappan).
5. How pill boards is using PH patterns to award schemes which is a clear debate in the public sphere. Can be linked to pharmaceuticals?

## **11. Gender, sexual health and reproductive rights**

*Members:* Sundari Ravindran, Sanghamitra Acharya, Sunita Reddy, Ramila Bisht, Anuj Kapalashrami, Karin Polit.

*Concept:*

1. Gender across the other themes.
2. Intersection of gender with other axes of vulnerability.
3. Gender development and health insurance.
4. The specific forms and trajectories of sexual health.

*Aims:*

1. Consultation on gender and health. Early 2014 in Kerala.
2. Review papers on gender dimensions and financial mechanisms.
3. Methodology workshop on intersectionality.
4. Sharing teaching resources – courses on gender and health, pooling resources, identifying gaps and adding on modules to keep abreast of advances in understanding gender and health. Developing a network on gender and health.

*Action:*

1. Consultation- **Sundari**.
2. Collating and reviewing curricula by end August 2013. **Ramila**
3. Working on review paper on the specific forms and trajectories of commercialisation of sexual health – **Sundari** and **Karin**.
4. Methodology workshop-proposal: **Ramila**

*Other issues:*

1. Other suggested topics:
  - a. Gender based violence beyond domestic violence.
    - b. Hierarchical relations in sexually active and reproductive-ally active women. Childlessness and stigmatisation.
    - c. Gender and women health providers.
    - d. Sexual and reproductive health – ethics and surrogacy.

## **12. Social exclusion in health care**

*Members:* Sanghamitra Acharya, Biju Soman, Dina Sidhva, Sunita Reddy, Sundari Ravindran, Roger Jeffery.

*Concept:*

1. Understanding social exclusion—conceptualizing and measuring processes that create the exclusionary mechanisms.
2. Group versus individual discrimination
3. Who are vulnerable? Rationale for examining the vulnerability, technology and how it includes or excludes groups of people, needs to address inequalities as a starting point to understand discrimination.
4. Financing mechanisms that accentuate exclusion from access to care.
5. Disadvantage induced social inclusion.

*Aim:*

1. Curriculum development workshop- teaching input and resources, developing teaching modules and online courses.
2. Development of a blended course which is online and culminates in 2 weeks classroom teaching. To inspire the next generation and make them aware of these issues. January 2015?

*Action:*

1. **Sanghamitra** to take lead in organizing the workshop and the curriculum but others to share responsibility.

*Other issues:*

1. Migrant health—mechanisms through which their vulnerability is produced.
2. Missed opportunities: Research methodology and definition for capturing both qualitative and quantitative.
3. Can help in the study of intersectionality. (Sundari).

## **13. Reproductive technologies:**

*Members:* Harish Naraindas, Karin Polit, Rama Baru, Sunita Reddy, Ramila Bisht, Sandra Bärnreuther

*Concept:*

1. What happens with high technology mechanisms.
2. Understanding bereavement and state legislated death.
3. Women denied IVF can that be seen as bereavement?
4. Sex-selective embryos.

*Aim:*

1. Sharing ongoing work.
2. Panel for ASA next year and a bigger conference later.
3. Special issue.



*Action:*

## **14. Bio-technology**

*Members:* Mohan Rao, Roger Jeffery, Adi Bhardwaj, Ian Harper, Sandra Bärnreuther, Raman Kutty.

*Concepts:*

1. Growth left to private section. India – population, genetic diversity, cheap costs of human life.
2. 3 sites: Bangalore, Pune and Gurgaon.
3. Three areas: diagnostics, therapeutics and vaccines.
4. Qualitative studies on stem cells. How does this match with epidemiological (?) studies?

*Aim:*

1. Proposal on transnational connections, issues of governance, regulations, methodologies.

*Action:*

1. Background paper to be converted to proposal: **Mohan, Roger and Sandra** (?)

## **15. Methodology:**

1. Should there be a mega stand alone or multiple sessions on this? Instead of a single workshop: two sessions attached to each relevant workshop?
2. The projects which identified methodological workshops as important, how best to represent their interest.

*Action:*

1. **Ramila** to write the proposal, **Thankappan, Dina** and **Sandra** to assist.

## **Other points:**

1. Contributions to concrete works or participation by presenting papers.
2. Social exclusion and surrogacy could form one group.
3. Time commitments have to be budgeted in as most members have teaching commitments.
4. In the interest of possible students, a plan of a stronger sense of what is happening? What is going forward from research point of view? Then methodology can be tailored towards these main areas.