

AROGYAM opening workshop, 2-4 June 2012

Attending:

ACHUTHA MENON CENTRE for HEALTH SCIENCES, THIRUVANANTHAPURAM: K R Thankappan, Sundari Ravindran, Raman Kutty, Biju Soman, K. N. Srinivasan

UNIVERSITY of EDINBURGH: Roger Jeffery, Jeff Collins, Anuj Kapalashrami, Jacob Copeman, Stefan Ecks, Sumeet Jain, Debbie Menezes, Ian Harper, George Palattiyil, Dina Sidhva, Liz Grant, Karina Kleinman, Margret Frenz, Supurna Banerjee (workshop organiser)

HEIDELBERG UNIVERSITY: William Sax, Sylvia Sax, Michael Marx, Johannes Quack, Hasan Ashraf, Ananda Samir Chopra, Karin Polit, Eva Ambos, Sandra Bärnreuther

JAWAHARLAL NEHRU UNIVERSITY, DELHI: Mohan Rao, Harish Naraindas, Rama Baru, Ritu Priya, Rajib Dasgupta, Sunita Reddy, Ramila Bisht, Sanghamitra Acharya.

After general Introductions, the workshop went into a series of small working groups to develop the themes set out in the original proposal:

- Non-communicable diseases, with special reference to issues surrounding diabetes, obesity, mental health and tobacco use, and the implications when populations cross national boundaries.
- Communicable diseases, with special reference to HIV/AIDS, malaria and TB.
- Medical Innovations and Biomedical technology, with special reference to stem-cells, bio-banking, clinical and public health research trials, community health monitoring and pharmaceuticals.
- Transcultural health studies, with particular reference to medical tourism and Asian Medical Systems. This will include work on indigenous medical systems, and the extent that they are adapting to (or resisting) biomedical domination, both in India and (through the introduction of Ayurveda etc.) in Europe.

These small groups developed sub-themes from the four main themes in the original proposal, and reported on the final day with the following main proposals:

Reports from sub-theme groups:

1. *Global Governance:*

Members: Sylvia Sax, Jeff Collins, Raman Kutty, Mohan Rao, Anuj Kapalashrami, Harish Naraindas, Rama Baru

This group foresaw work on new actors and discourses in GG and gaps in research on them; the impact of Global Health initiatives in local case context. E.g. technology and farmers; India as a global actor and how it is influencing the European context; and NCDs/commercial sector as a subset of GG.

Aims: Publication; Conference; Sharing teaching resources

Actions: Developing a concept note for workshop in Delhi in 2014 followed by a 2nd one in Edinburgh as a part of Association of Social Anthropologists conference. **Sylvia Sax, Rama Baru, Anuj Kapilashrami.**

2. NCDs.

Members: Michael Marx, Sylvia Sax, Jeff Collins, Ritu Priya

This group planned work on (1) governance, palliative care, self-management, cultural perspectives, role of traditions, social determinants, reducing inequalities, lifestyle vs biomedical explanations and discourses; (2) the industrial production of NCDs—trans-national food-drink industry, commercialisation of health, advertising, policy coherence, economic impact of NCDs, consumption pattern.

Aims: Colloquium; Teaching activities; Concept note and inventory of existing research; Proposal for case study.

Action: Joint work with the GG group. **Jeff Collin, Michael Marx.**

3. Globalizing mental health

Members: Bo Sax, Johannes Quack, Hasan Ashraf, Harish Naraindas, Ananda Samir Chopra, Karin Polit, Jacob Copeman, Stefan Ecks, Sumeet Jain, Raman Kutty, Biju Soman, Eva Ambos, Ritu Priya, Debbie Menezes

This group was interested to work on initiatives in India which are currently being discussed; the political economy of mental health: psycho pharmaceuticals, ethnography of pharmaceuticals used, other kinds of expert social-psychological help; culture and value: ritual and faith based cure in Europe and India; disciplining mental health, understood in Foucauldian ways; palliative care.

Aims: Conference; Exchange of teaching materials.

Action: Proposed panel for the ASA conference in Edinburgh next year or a conference in Europe. (June-July 2014) to be immediately followed by a two days of developing a proposal. Possible involvement with Liz Grant in a summer school in India next year. **Bo Sax.**

4. Pharmaceutical markets

Members: Hasan Ashraf, Roger Jeffery, Ian Harper, Sundari Ravindran, Mohan Rao.

This group planned to study the drift of pharmaceuticals from regulated to unregulated markets, with a focus on psychotropic medicines and emergency abortion pills; 'following' different medicines; the historical background of medicine and the spread of its network; the pharmaceutical and media interface especially involving women and children. Possible link with GG as there are cross-cutting themes.

Aim: Research proposal for studying the drift from regulated to unregulated pharmaceutical markets.

Action: Developing the proposal. **Hasan Ashraf, Roger Jeffery.**

5. HIV AIDS

Members: George Palattiyil, Dina Sidhva, Anuj Kapalashrami, Liz Grant, K. N. Srinivasan, Sundari Ravindran.

Aims: Research proposal; Teaching course; Workshop with edited volume; Synergy with HHRD; Possible links with GG and its policy strands; Biography of NGOs.

Actions: Develop proposal; Teaching pack. **George Palattiyil, K N Srinivasan, Sundari Ravindran, Dina Sidhva, Anuj Kapalashrami, Liz Grant.**

6. Tuberculosis

Members: Rajib Dasgupta, Ian Harper, Sundari Ravindran, Ramila Bisht.

The group planned to look at the historical aspects: Failure of the former programme, focussing on International financing and programme governance.

Aims: Edited volume on 25 years of DOTS, with research workshop in Delhi in 2014 (synergized with other groups) and a larger workshop with chapter authors in late 2014-early 2015.

Action: Drafting the concept note for the edited volume; looking for funding, possibly to involve two PhD students in the communicable disease programme in Leeds. **Rajib Dasgupta, Ian Harper**

7. Infectious diseases

Members: Ian Harper, Karina Kielmann, Sanndra Bärnreuther,

The group considered a focus on diagnostics and technologies, that weave through various levels of patient experience. Other technologies like the use of mobile phones etc. Links to GG but also to other diseases such as malaria.

Aim: Firstly a paper on diagnostics in infectious diseases.

Action: Conceptual paper: **Ian Harper, Karina Kielmann.**

8. Medical Tourism

Members: Margret Frenz, K. N Srinivasan, Roger Jeffery, Rama Baru, Sandra Bärnreuther

While medical tourism was the working title, the group recognised a need to reconceptualise this, to look at quality assurance in public and private hospitals and how it links to commercialization. Other possible foci were the role played by NRIs, how medical tourism was marketed by allopathic and Ayurvedic medicine; the motivations for European companies to choose Indian markets; governance issues.

Aims: Scoping studies, comparing India, Scotland and Germany to show multiple movements; a workshop on the Indo-European fertility private market networks; Mapping of European and Indian clinics through formal and informal networks.

Action: Workshop as a proposal developing meeting; creation of a teaching module possible for Summer School (Liz's summer school); developing research proposals. **Margret Frenz, K. N. Srinivasan.**

9. Surrogacy

Members: Sunita Reddy, Dina Sidhva, George Palattiyil

Attention needs to be paid to the parent's perspective on surrogacy. Links to medical tourism (Mohan)

Aims: Conception workshop or seminar in August 2014; developing a research proposal based on the scoping study started by George and Dina on surrogacy.

Action: Research proposal on commissioning parent's perspectives on surrogacy: **Sunita Reddy, Dina Sidhva, George Palattiyil.**

10. Commercial sector and public health:

The main areas of focus for this group were newer institutional and legislative frameworks emerging to enable the commercial sector GHIs and philanthropies; the tensions between trade and PH objectives – including (a) Health policy (impact on healthcare of tobacco, food and beverage, managing COI); (b) Health system issues – World Bank preference for private actors; (c) Health research. There are methodological challenges – what are the sources? What methods of data collection for sensitive data and non-transparent commercial sector?

Aims: Sharing teaching resources, including key articles; Workshop in February 2014 in Delhi; Methodology training workshop Ongoing dialogue on comparative examples of commercialisation

Action: Teaching resources repository—possible zotero library or drop box, website for AROGYAM; Workshop organization (combined with GG); Methodology proposal. **Jeff Collin, Mohan Rao, Anuj Kapilashrami, Rama Baru, Sylvia Sax, Ramila Bisht.**

11. Gender, sexual health and reproductive rights

Members: Sundari Ravindran, Sanghamitra Acharya, Sunita Reddy, Ramila Bisht, Anuj Kapilashrami, Karin Polit.

This group would ensure that gender was considered across the other themes; look into intersections of gender with other axes of vulnerability; consider aspects of gender, development and health insurance; and the specific forms and trajectories of sexual health.

Aims: Consultation on gender and health. Early 2014 in Kerala; Review papers on gender dimensions and financial mechanisms; Methodology workshop on intersectionality; Sharing teaching resources—courses on gender and health, pooling resources, identifying gaps and adding on modules to keep abreast of advances in understanding gender and health. Developing a network on gender and health.

Action: Consultation; Collating and reviewing curricula; Review paper on the specific forms and trajectories of commercialisation of sexual health; Methodology workshop-proposal. **Sundari Ravindran, Ramila Bisht, Karin Polit.**

12. Social exclusion in health care

Members: Sanghamitra Acharya, Biju Soman, Dina Sidhva, Sunita Reddy, Sundari Ravindran, Roger Jeffery.

The group would focus on conceptualizing and measuring processes that create exclusionary mechanisms, at group and individual levels, asking who are vulnerable. Rationale for examining vulnerability, technology

and how it includes or excludes groups of people, needs to address inequalities as a starting point to understand discrimination. How do financing mechanisms accentuate exclusion from access to care; how does disadvantage induce social exclusion.

Aims: Curriculum development workshop - teaching input and resources, developing teaching modules and online courses; Development of a blended course which is online and culminates in 2 weeks classroom teaching, to inspire the next generation and make them aware of these issues.

Action: **Sanghamitra Acharya** to take lead in organizing the workshop and the curriculum but others to share responsibility.

13. Reproductive technologies:

Members: Harish Naraindas, Karin Polit, Rama Baru, Sunita Reddy, Ramila Bisht, Sandra Bärnreuther

This group would look at what happens with high technology interventions, and link this to understanding bereavement and state-legislated death, and what happens to women denied IVF (can that be seen as bereavement?) and sex-selective embryos.

Aims: Sharing ongoing work; Panel for ASA next year and a bigger conference later; Special issue of a journal or edited collection.

Action: **Harish Naraindas** to take lead.

14. Bio-technology

Members: Mohan Rao, Roger Jeffery, Adi Bhardwaj, Ian Harper, Sandra Bärnreuther, Raman Kutty.

How had the growth in bio-technology been left to private sector; why India—population, genetic diversity, cheap costs of human life? Could study the emerging hotspots in India (Bangalore, Pune and Gurgaon) and three areas: diagnostics, therapeutics and vaccines.

Aim: Proposal on transnational connections, issues of governance, regulations, methodologies.

Action: Background paper to be converted to proposal: **Mohan Rao, Roger Jeffery, Sandra Bärnreuther**

15. Methodology:

The group discussed whether there should be a stand-alone or multiple sessions on this, attached to each relevant workshop. It was important to represent the interest of the projects which identified methodological workshops as important.

16. Timetable for next actions:

Group co-ordinators to send proposals by 29 July

Local leaders to agree decisions about funding by 10 August

Roger Jeffery, Edinburgh, 15 June, 2012